



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	<u>International Journal of Biochemistry Research & Review</u>
Manuscript Number:	2013_IJBcRR_4464
Title of the Manuscript:	Glutathione S-Transferase enzyme (GSTT1 and GSTM1) Gene Polymorphisms in End Stage Renal Disease among Egyptian Population
Type of the Article	Research paper

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. The Authors investigated the association between glutathione S-transferase enzyme (GSTT1 and GSTM1) gene polymorphisms and end stage renal disease (ESRD) in Egyptian population; the association between GST enzyme levels and GSTT1 and GSTM1 genotypes. They analysed some parameters of lipid peroxidation in ESRD. It must be underline in the aim of the study. 2. Why the Authors analysed the relations between MDA level and GST enzyme gene polymorphisms? It is only association between two factors. 3. A characteristic of the study groups is too short. Are the ESRD patients on peritoneal dialysis or haemodialysis? What are the causes of ESRD? Was the controls sex-matched group? The study groups are different according to the age. This parameter can influence lipid disorders. 4. The discussion is superficial. 5. The conclusion: - the ESRD group is small, so it must be added to the first sentence " in Egyptian population". -	1. Done. 2. Result section was reviewed and edited. 3. Haemodialysis was written in section (2.1. Subject). 4. Some causes of ESRD in the Egyptian cases in this study were: hypertension, vesicoureter reflux, obstructive uropathy, ischaemic heart diseases, drugs and glomerulonephritis, diabetic nephropathy, systemic lupus erythematosus and unknown causes. These causes were not mentioned in the text because this study aimed to focus on ESRD itself and to investigate the oxidative status of ESRD patients on (haemodialysis) for years due to ESRD for any cause behind it. Also, each cause needed a big number of cases to perform an accurate comparison between them, and this number, (133) related to ESRD patients following diagnosis of ESRD by nephrologists, was difficulty available in performing time of study. After the



SDI Review Form 1.6

	- the Authors stated: "The GSTM1 (null) genotype, (GSTT1/0) and (0/0) genotypes are independent risk factors for ESRD". What is the basis of such statement? - the last sentence: the high levels of MDA and low levels of GST enzyme are significantly associated with the risk factors of GSTT1 and GSTM1 genotypes in ESRD of the Egyptian population" isn't true.	comment about causes, these causes were added in 2.1 Subjects section at the paragraph (1) as general information about ESRD patients in this study. Gender: most of the cases in patients and control group were men, this also were added in 2.1 Subjects section. Age: The samples of healthy cases in this study that had this age range were available in this time; generally samples were difficult to be obtained. Also, they were free from any diseases according to accurate laboratory analysis. 4. and 5. The discussion and conclusion were edited.
--	--	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

Minor REVISION comments	In the discussion the Authors repeated p- value. It is unnecessary. Figure 2 and 3 show the same data as Table 2 and Table 3, respectively. Reference style is incorrect. See: guideline for authors.	It is removed. These figures were removed. References were corrected.
Optional/General comments	The aim of the study is interesting, but its results should be reanalysed.	Results were edited.